

## CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES

DATE: NOVEMBER 6, 2014

The City of Cincinnati's Civil Service Commission met in regular session in Room 307, City Hall on Thursday, November 6, 2014. Commissioners in attendance were Mr. James Robinson, Chair, and Mr. Robert Braddock, Vice-Chair. Commission staff present included Ms. Georgetta Kelly, Civil Service Secretary, Ms. Nancy Olind, Assistant Human Resources Director, and Ms. Seeta Martindale, Recording Secretary.

### AGENDA ITEMS

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE 10/23/2014 MEETING.** Minutes were previously routed and reviewed. Commissioner Braddock made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Robinson seconded the motion, and the minutes were unanimously approved.

#### **APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE:**

**Duane Turner, Selena Ervin, Mack Johnson, Anetra Reeves, Roderick Glenn, Jasper Greer, and Frank Cook to full-time Laborers in the Public Services Department.** The identified personnel all meet the qualifications for the position of full-time Laborer and were selected by the employing unit, within the collective bargaining guidelines, based on their seniority. This item was approved by the Commission.

**Katherine Smith to the position of Florist in the Parks Department.** This position was posted as an Open-Competitive exam. The staff recommended approval of this item as Ms. Smith meets the minimum requirements for the position, completed the Structured Oral Interview process, meet the needs of the department, and was selected from among the passing candidates referred to the department. This item was approved by the Commission.

**Nicholas Sharp to the position of Casework Associate in the Health Department.** This position was posted as an Open-Competitive, Training and Experience exam. The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Sharp meets the minimum requirements for the position, was graded with a passing score on the exam, meets the needs of the department, and was selected from among the passing candidates referred to the department. This item was approved by the Commission.

#### **APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE: Non-Competitive**

**Elvin Wade to the position of Cement Finisher in the Public Services Department.** The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Wade meets the minimum qualifications and possesses the specific skills needed by the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

**Kathryn Millhoan to the position of Public Health Nurse 2 in the Health Department.** The staff recommended approval of this item as Ms. Millhoan meets the minimum qualifications and possesses the specific skills needed by the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

**MINUTES cont'd...**

**LaTasha Heisel to the position of Public Health Nurse 2 in the Health Department.** The staff recommended approval of this item as Ms. Heisel meets the minimum qualifications and possesses the specific skills needed by the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

**Sharetha Collier to the position of Medical Assistant in the Health Department.** The staff recommended approval of this item as Ms. Collier meets the minimum qualifications and possesses the specific skills needed by the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

**Sharma Robinson to the position of Public Health Nurse 2 in the Health Department.** The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Robinson meets the minimum qualifications and possesses the specific skills needed by the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

**Matthew Flannery to the position of Inspector 1 (PMCE) in the Department of Trade and Development.** The staff recommended approval of this item as Mr. Flannery meets the minimum qualifications and possesses the specific skills needed by the department. Based on the professional nature of the work, the requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Promotion**

**Brent Miley to the position of Supervisor of Maintenance in the Department of Sewers.** Mr. Miley successfully passed the Supervisor of Maintenance promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

**Daniel Watson to the position of Senior Accountant in the Fire Department.** Mr. Watson successfully passed the Senior Accountant promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

**David Browning to the position of Supervisor of Maintenance in the Water Works Department.** Mr. Browning successfully passed the Supervisor of Maintenance promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

**Jonathan Gordon to the position of Administrative Technician in the Water Works Department.** Mr. Gordon successfully passed the Administrative Technician promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

**Karen Miller to the position of Administrative Technician in the Water Works Department.** Ms. Miller successfully passed the Administrative Technician promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

**MINUTES cont'd...**

**Matthew Menkhaus to the position of Administrative Specialist in the Water Works Department.**

Mr. Menkhaus successfully passed the Administrative Specialist promotional exam, meets the minimum requirements for the position, and was selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

**Erica Ward and Carolyn Jackson to the position of Service Area Coordinator in the Public Services Department.**

Ms. Ward and Ms. Jackson successfully passed the Service Area Coordinator promotional exam, meet the minimum requirements for the position and were selected within the collective bargaining agreement guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department by staff. These appointments were made following the department's climate assessment; of which the Commission was made aware as part of an ongoing audit process by the Human Resources Department. This item was noted by the Commission.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Working out of Class**

**Gailene Hill to the position of Supervising Buildings Plans Examiner and Code Analyst in the City Planning and Buildings Department.**

Ms. Hill was selected for temporary assignment to work out of class in the position of Supervising Buildings Plans Examiner and Code Analyst in the Department of Planning and Buildings. This assignment falls within the collective bargaining guidelines of the Cincinnati Organized and Dedicated Employees (CODE) union, of which Ms. Hill is presently a member. This item was noted by the Commission.

**Douglas Robinson to the position of Finance Manager (Purchasing Agent) in the Finance Department.**

Mr. Robinson was selected for temporary assignment to work out of class in the position of Finance Manager (Purchasing Agent) in the Finance Department. This assignment falls within the collective bargaining guidelines of the Cincinnati Organized and Dedicated Employees (CODE) union, of which Mr. Robinson is presently a member. This item was noted by the Commission.

**Theresa Stark to the position of Contract Compliance Officer in the City Manager's Office/Contract Compliance Division.**

Ms. Stark was selected for temporary assignment to work out of class in the position of Contract Compliance Officer in the City Manager's Office/Contract Compliance Division. This assignment falls within the collective bargaining guidelines of the Cincinnati Organized and Dedicated Employees (CODE) union, of which Ms. Stark is presently a member. This item was noted by the Commission.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Re-assignment/Transfer**

**Re-assignment of Jennifer Mobley to the classification of Supervisor of Parks/Recreation Maintenance and Construction in the Parks Department.**

After conducting an audit of the Supervising Parks/Recreation Coordinator classification specification, at the request of the Parks Department, it was determined that the deletion of the position and re-assignment of the incumbent, Ms. Mobley to the position of Supervisor of Parks/Recreation Maintenance and Construction would align more equitably with the scope of work and responsibilities of other employees performing similar job duties in the Parks Department. This item was approved by the Commission.

**MINUTES cont'd...**

**Kathleen Frey to the position of Administrative Specialist from the Department of Water Works to the Department of Sewers.** Ms. Frey meets the minimum qualifications for the transfer and was selected within the collective bargaining guidelines from among the candidates referred to the department. This item was noted by the Commission.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Temporary Promotion**

**Stephen Gerth to the position of Parks/Recreation Superintendent (Recreation) in the Recreation Department.** Based upon the critical operational needs of the department it is necessary to temporarily appoint someone who is readily available, and possesses the required skill sets and experience to the position of Parks/Recreation Superintendent (Recreation). Mr. Gerth meets these requirements and was chosen for temporary promotion. The department requested to suspend the rotation of this position, until the position is filled permanently, due to the need to provide consistency in the directives and disciplines that this position entails. This item was approved by the Commission with the rotation requirement suspended.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Promotion Without Exam**

**Nicholas Hughes to the position of Electrical Maintenance Worker 2 in the Water Works Department.** Mr. Hughes meets the minimum requirements of the position, has successfully held the position of Electrical Maintenance Worker 1 since October 30, 2011, which makes him eligible for this promotion per the guidelines stated in the Electrical Maintenance Worker 2 classification specification. The requirement for competition was suspended by the Commission and the appointment was approved.

**Otto Bauer-Nilsen to the position of Senior Building Plans Examiner and Analyst in the City Planning and Buildings Department.** The position was posted within the department in an effort to determine the level of interest and eligibility for the position. Mr. Bauer-Nilsen was selected for this position as he meets the minimum requirements, fulfills the needs of the department, and was the only interested and qualified candidate in the employing unit. The requirement for competition was suspended and the appointment was approved.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Transfer**

**Arnell Jackson to the position of Supervising Management Analyst (Human Resources) from the Human Resources Department to the Department of Sewers.** Due to re-organizational efforts in the Department of Human Resources, and in support of the shared service model in the Departments of Water and Sewers, Ms. Jackson has been selected for transfer to the position of Supervising Management Analyst (Human Resources). Ms. Jackson meets the minimum qualifications for the position and is eligible to return to the classified service. This item was approved by the Commission.

**Rochelle Thompson to the position of Supervising Management Analyst (Human Resources) from the City Manager's Office/Contract Compliance Division to the Human Resources Department.** Ms. Thompson meets the qualifications for the position as listed on the approved Supervising Human Resources Analyst classification specification. This action was taken in accordance with Civil Service rules and the City Manager's direction. This item was approved by the Commission.

**MINUTES cont'd...**

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Review Session Test Materials**

**Request from staff for the approval of examination materials to be used in the exam Review Session(s) by candidates who completed the Fire Apparatus Operator promotional exam.** The staff provided information related to the review sessions and recommended approval of the review session materials. These items were approved.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Special Examiners**

- a) Mr. Darrin Edwards (Colerain Township) for the Fire Apparatus Operator promotional exam
- b) Ken Bertke, Dave Cavanaugh, and Mark Toelke for the Automotive Mechanic examination

The staff recommended approval of the special examiners. These items were approved by the Commission.

**ELIGIBLE LISTS: Request for Approval**

- a) Fire Apparatus Operator – Promotional

The staff provided information pertaining to the eligible list and recommended approval. This item was approved and the list will be posted on the City's Website following exam Review Sessions, as needed.

**CLASSIFICATION: Request for the approval of new and/or revised classification specifications:**

- a) Finance Manager (Employee Benefits/Risk Manager)
- b) Legal Assistant (Governance)
- c) Supervising Buildings Plans Examiner and Code Analyst
- d) Wastewater Collection Supervisor

The staff recommended approval of the new/revised classification specifications. These classification specifications were approved by the Commission.

**CLASSIFICATION: Request from Departments to add/delete positions to their table of organization:**

- a) **Department of Sewers:** Add (1) Accounting Technician 2 and Delete (1) Administrative Technician
- b) **Finance Department:** Add (1) Nursing Supervisor and Delete (1) Public Health Physician
- c) **Health Department:** Add (3) Nurse Practitioners and (6) Medical Assistants
- d) **Parks Department:** Add (1) Facility Maintenance Specialist and (3) Florists
- e) **Police Department:** Add (1) Senior Administrative Specialist
- f) **Transportation and Engineering:** Add (1) Assistant Director
- g) **Water Works Department (per City Council and Office of Budget & Evaluation):** Add (1) Senior Engineer and (1) Heat Ventilation & Air Conditioning Specialist

**MINUTES cont'd...**

The staff supported its recommendations for approval of the add/delete positions by presenting budget and organizational information relating to each item and the items were approved.

**APPEAL TO THE COMMISSION: Information Items:**

**Appeal Hearing Schedule:**

Name	Scheduled for:
Robert DeBonis	Scheduling Suspended/Appellant awaiting delivery of Public Records Material
Anthony Axle	Written Commission Decision to follow
Vinson Key	Continuance requested by Appellant on May 30, 2014/Contacted by Staff regarding re-scheduling
Jeff Stallworth	Staff contacted Appellant in the attempt to re-schedule Hearing date
Daryl Ross	On Hold/Law Dept. providing updates

The staff provided information on the current Appeal Hearing Schedule. The Commission noted this item.

**APPLICATION FOR ENTRANCE EXAM:**

**Request from Alexandria Carpenter for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) exam.** Ms. Carpenter was present at the meeting to explain the reason for her absence for the exam. Mr. Darrell Ludlow, Senior Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department was also present. The staff recommended denial of the request. After considering the matter, the Commission denied the request.

**Request from Joshua Brians for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) exam.** Mr. Brians was not present at the meeting. The staff provided information pertaining to Mr. Brians' request with a recommendation to deny the request. After considering the matter, the Commission denied the request.

**Request from Kaitlin Reams for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) exam.** Ms. Reams was not present at the meeting. The staff provided information pertaining to Ms. Reams' request with a recommendation to deny the request. After considering the matter, the Commission denied the request.

**Request from Kurtis Jacobs for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) exam.** Mr. Jacobs was not present at the meeting. The staff provided information pertaining to Mr. Jacobs' request with a recommendation to deny the request. After considering the matter, the Commission denied the request.

**Request from Sara Day for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) exam.** Ms. Day did not appear before the Commission. The staff provided information pertaining to Ms. Day's request with a recommendation to deny the request. After considering the matter, the Commission denied the request.

**Request from Tyler Werner for an alternate exam date for the Police Recruit (Open) exam.** Mr. Werner was not present at the meeting. The staff provided information pertaining to Mr. Werner's request with a recommendation to deny the request. After considering the matter, the Commission denied the request.

**MINUTES cont'd...**

**Request from Alexandria White to appeal the rejection of her application for the Supervising Management Analyst (Human Resources) position.** Ms. White was present at the meeting and spoke before the Commission. After considering the matter, the Commission denied the request.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request to Speak Before Commission**

**Request from Karen Goodman to speak before the Commission regarding promotional action taken on the Facility Maintenance Specialist position.** Ms. Goodman was present at the meeting and spoke before the Commission relating to her concerns surrounding promotional actions taken on the Facility Maintenance Specialist eligible list. The staff provided information referencing the Commission's prior approval of a joint-effort classification study; conducted in collaboration with the AFSCME Union, relevant departments, pertinent employees, and the Human Resources Department, resulting in the promotion of Mr. Marty Morehead to the position of Facility Maintenance Specialist. The Commission heard her comments and noted her concerns.

**Request from Daniel Wehner to speak before the Commission regarding the Fire Apparatus Operator promotional exam.** Mr. Wehner was present at the meeting and addressed the Commission regarding the grading of the practical assessment portion of the examination and the manner in which the special examiner administered the examination. Staff provided information regarding each candidate receiving advance detailed instruction and special examiners being given explicit instructions to not provide any additional information at the exam site. The Commission heard his comments and noted his concerns.

**Request from Phillip Jones to speak before the Commission regarding his termination from the Water Works Department.** Mr. Jones was not present at the meeting. The Commission heard the request and granted an appeal hearing date to be scheduled by Civil Service staff and communicated to all parties concerned.

**Request from David Johnson to speak before the Commission regarding his termination from the Water Works Department.** Mr. Johnson was not present at the meeting. The Commission heard the request and granted an appeal hearing date to be scheduled by Civil Service staff and communicated to all parties concerned.

**ADDITIONAL INFORMATION:**

**The legal representatives of the Cincinnati Organization of Dedicated Employees (CODE) Bargaining Unit have requested to address each item on the agenda per Civil Service Rule 2, Section 5.** CODE representatives were not present at the meeting. All items were noted by the Commission as waived.